

Title: Latin American History through the Novel

- ✓ **Instructor: Lois Zamora**
- ✓ **Institution: Learners TV**
- ✓ **Dictated: 조소영, 안지영, 신세현**



🔊 **[2:00]** Already, here we are one more time and we are starting.

🔊 **[2:04]** We began, last time, "Recollections of things to come" by Elena Garro and now we're going to get into a little bit more deeply.

🔊 **[2:13]** Umm, I wouldn't, we saw the historical context last time and of course you should look more into that yourselves.

🔊 **[2:21]** If you are interested, all you have to do is put Cristero rebellion into google, then you'll find plenty of material on it.

🔊 **[2:30]** We looked at some of the places in the novel where the main players are referred to, Madeiro, of course, the Mexican revolutionary Zapata, Angeles, Panchovia, Francisco Via, that we looked at a reference to try to **[? 2:43]**.

🔊 **[2:46]** There a lot more and..

🔊 **[2:48]** Uh, So you'll have noticed those as you go along, I hope.

🔊 **[2:52]** Let's say that we have this kind of what we do have the historical rather specifical historical backdrop, which we've not talked about.

🔊 **[3:00]** Religious conflict a kind of counter-revolution to the Mexican revolution.



🔊 [3:05] And then we have in the foreground.

🔊 [3:07] It's all this mythic magical stuff.

🔊 [3:10] We have characters that disappear into thin air.

🔊 [3:12] We have narrator who is the land itself.

🔊 [3:16] We have almost page by page references to cut the timelessness of the place.

🔊 [3:22] So, this is one of those novels that I really do have to call magical realism.

🔊 [3:28] I don't realist, I don't have any hesitation there because the conventions the realism is defied so many times, we have to notice.

🔊 [3:38] I'm particularly interested and I'm going to talk more later next time with you and show you some images of the Meso American [? 03:46].

🔊 [3:47] Elena Garro knew very well. The indigenous heritage of Mexico.

🔊 [3:52] And one of the things that remains, despite the destruction of European colonization are texts called [? 4:01].

🔊 [4:01] There are the painted books that the Nawa and Maya peoples wrote with images before the arrival of the Europeans and thus the arrival of the alphabet.

🔊 [4:14] And there is a time space.

🔊 [4:16] It's one word or with a slash between time space.

🔊 [4:20] Time space. Conception that is very different in indigenous cultures.

🔊 [4:24] We've already seen it.

🔊 [4:25] We just did it with the storyteller, the idea that, you know, time is continuous and progresses in linear and all of that goes by the by with the story tellers in Machiguenga group in here too.

🔊 [4:37] There is a substratum of indigenous culture so, I'll talk to you about that next time.



🔊 [4:44] But here I think let's just start by sorting out the plot.

🔊 [4:48] Could somebody just do that for us if you had to say three minutes of what, how this plot unfolds?

🔊 [4:54] Could someone do that to just help this out?

🔊 [4:58] Who's got that, it's simple, it's pretty simple plot, really.

🔊 [5:02] Let's see, Amanda here, you'll love this novel.

🔊 [5:05] Yeah, Amanda loves this novel.

🔊 [5:08] So, She'll do it for us.

🔊 [5:09] Would you please, Amanda?

🔊 [5:11] (Student) It's the story of um..Rosas, Francisco Rosas.

🔊 [5:16] He's the military leader.

🔊 [5:17] He comes to the town with a mistress called Julia.

🔊 [5:20] She leaves him with the stranger Felipe Hurtado and then you kind of, introduce also to the Moncada family which is Isabel Nicholas and Juan, their mother and their father. They...

🔊 [5:34] (Professor) This is Moncada. So I've got fairly diagram on our blackboard so that's what I'm going to doing it, because it's apparently a family saga, really.

🔊 [5:42] (Student) They, um, they all kind of look at Julia and she something different... but that's not really what the stories about.

🔊 [5:48] Julia leaves, Rosas becomes even more dictate, dictatorial.

🔊 [5:54] And they hide a priest, from military people because they started to going on.. you know, [? 6:00] and everything.

🔊 [6:02] And they hold big fiesta in order to get to the priest out from the town undercover.

🔊 [6:07] But Rosas is on to them.

🔊 [6:09] He makes and stay there all overnight.

🔊 [6:12] He captures the priest, he captures one of the prostitutes from Chia and El presidente the leader of the prostitutes.

🔊 [6:23] And, basically, he kills all people involved and Isabella becomes his mistress, she begs him for Nicholas's life.

🔊 [6:32] One dies, and he says okay, he's going to give Isabella her brother but her brother offers her himself up and shot anyway, even somebody else is shot in his place.

🔊 [6:46] And Francisco Rosas can't do with Isabella.

🔊 [6:49] She smothers him even though she's a mistress and he can't dare to touch her.

🔊 [6:53] And he runs away from her the same way that Judea ran away from him.

🔊 [6:57] And that's how it ends and Isabella goes on and becomes stunned because she loves Rosas and...

🔊 [7:03] (Professor) She's ostracized from her community.

🔊 [7:08] She takes sides with this dictator whose communes are strong-armed towns.

🔊 [7:14] (Student) Yes, she loves him.

🔊 [7:16] But she tries to.. and in a way, he loves Julia and it's tragic, she loves him and it's tragic, so it doesn't end well at all.

🔊 [7:24] (Professor) Yes, right.

🔊 [7:25] Yeah, and of course, it doesn't begin well, because we know from the beginning that this town is already dead.

🔊 [7:31] And this is kind of mythic voice I hope in your discussion of the narrative technique that you notice that it is rather unusual narrator.

🔊 [7:39] The land.

🔊 [7:40] It's the stone promontory on which the town sat.

🔊 [7:46] And there's just kind of nostalgia really this, you almost cut it with a knife looking back it...when the town was alive.

🔊 [7:53] From the perspective of the town, it's dead and everyone in it is dead.

🔊 [7:59] It's a bit like Pedro Paramo in that way you would know at least Pedro Paramo.

🔊 [8:06] And, so there are towns that are told by a kind of mythic voice after it's all over and that's one of these.

🔊 [8:14] When Amanda was saying about Julia and Isabel needs to be discussed,

🔊 [8:19] first, Scott, if you could show this family tree that I put up on our board, there are two main families, so there are plenty of other characters with so many "m"s.

🔊 [8:30] The names beginning with "M", I just I thought, I would do this of course, Martin and Ana Moncada are the main ones and they are the parents of Juan Nicholas and Isabel, as Amanda told us.

🔊 [8:42] And then there are Malendez, Matilda and Joachim, Malendez and Joaquim .. in spanish Joaquim and Malendez, and they .. Martin and Matilde are brother and sister.

🔊 [9:02] So their children are cousins.

🔊 [9:04] It's not so important but I found myself as I was reading this novel the first time wanting to sketch out a kind of family trees at least of these two, two families that are related.

🔊 [9:16] There are as you know, Elvita and Conchita [? 9:20] yet another "M" name, but they are related and so we're going to leave them to one side.

🔊 [9:29] So everybody got that it's, you know, you would have noticed the connections are quite important in the sense that Martin and Matilde have different positions on the political events unfolding under there.

🔊 [9:42] Rosas, we looked at some of that last time, Martin is the liberal in the



crowd and other people are not.

🔊 [9:49] So we have these characters, we have this families living in this village.

🔊 [9:58] We know they're dead now and this novel comes back around to the beginning and we have Isabel made into a stone.

🔊 [10:03] This is magical realism.

🔊 [10:05] Real people aren't made into stones in my world.

🔊 [10:08] But in the novel's world they are, and we see..

🔊 [10:11] Why don't we just go to the end of the novel and look at that.

🔊 [10:14] And it is possible, I think to say,

🔊 [10:15] "Oh, it's Isabel who's the narrator of this novel."

🔊 [10:09] Because at the beginning we're told that it is a stone.

🔊 [10:24] It seems to me female voice.

🔊 [10:26] It's not identified as such that I remember but we could sort of say this stone business has something to do with Isabel.

🔊 [10:34] Look at the very final chapter of part two, page sixteen it's page to eighty eight in my volume, and I hope all of yours too.

🔊 [10:44] Two eighty eight, right?

🔊 [10:46] The weeks and months past unlike [? 10:49].

🔊 [10:49] We never became our old selves again that we and I that is perennial throughout this novel.

🔊 [10:56] It's the narrative voice of the community now dead.

🔊 [11:00] It's impossible, right?

🔊 [11:02] But so it's omniscient narration.

🔊 [11:04] That's an impossible thing too with the novel.

🔊 [11:07] But here, with this voice, let's say that it represents the collective history of Ikstepec, this town.

🔊 [11:17] And like [? 11:17], we never became our old selves again.

🔊 [11:19] Francisco Rosas always stopped being what he was, also stop being what he was.

🔊 [11:25] Drunk and unshaved, he no longer searched for anybody.

🔊 [11:28] One afternoon he went away on a troop train with a soldiers and aids we never heard of from him again.

🔊 [11:34] Other officers came to give lay into [? 11:37], the bad guy, right?

🔊 [11:39] and to repeat the hangings in a different silence and the branches of the same tree but never no one again invented fiesta to redeem men from execution.

🔊 [11:49] That plot detail that we were talking about earlier.

🔊 [11:56] The village puts together a party in order to sneak the priest out of town.

🔊 [12:05] Let's just, this isn't that much long, we'll go ahead and read it.

🔊 [12:08] There are times when strangers do not understand my fatigue or my dust.

🔊 [12:13] The town's.

🔊 [12:15] Because now there is no one to mention the name of the Moncadas.

🔊 [12:19] The stone the memory of my suffering and the end of the fiesta Carmen [? 12:24] are here.

🔊 [12:25] Gregoria put this inscription on her words were burned out fireworks.

🔊 [12:30] I am Isabel Moncada, the daughter of Martin Moncada and [? 12:36] Moncada born in the town of Ikstepec on December first, 1907.

🔊 [12:42] I turned into stone in October fifth 1927.



🔊 **[12:46]** Before the startled ideas, eyes of Gregoria Juardiz, this is what's written on the gravestone if you want or written on the stone that Isabel has become.

🔊 **[12:59]** It's not just a gravestone.

🔊 **[13:01]** I call the unhappiness of my parents in the death of my brothers Juan and Nicholas.

🔊 **[13:05]** When I came to ask divergent to cure me of my love for general Francisco Rosas who killed my brothers I repented for further love of the man who ruined me and ruined my family.

🔊 **[13:16]** Here, I shall be, alone with my love is a memory of the future forever and ever.

🔊 **[13:22]** So this memory of the future "Recuerdos del porvenir", recollections of things to come as it is translated.

🔊 **[13:29]** I think it's a mistake, is the same phrase "the memory of the future", "Los recuerdos del porvenir " in Spanish, memory of the future.

🔊 **[13:38]** I wish they just say memories of future.

🔊 **[13:41]** It would be better than recollections of things to come. Especially when they translated the same phrase here as memory of the future.

🔊 **[13:47]** In any case, that's the end of the novel, we get the Sisyphusian figure, pushing the rock up the hill in the engravings that the university of Texas press of it to add to its books.

🔊 **[13:58]** So, this wouldn't have to do those engravings with Garro.

🔊 **[14:03]** But okay, so we have this stone ends the novel.

🔊 **[14:07]** Let's look at the one that begins it.

🔊 **[14:10]** And as I said it's possible, I think, to read Isabel as the narrator.

🔊 **[14:13]** I prefer not to read the novel as the kind of mythic voice that echoes.

🔊 **[14:19]** As in a place been deserted for a long time, and we are told again and again that this is dusty and there used to be people in my streets and all of this stuff.



🔊 [14:28] So it's.. there's that rock.

🔊 [14:30] The picture at the chapter one, very beginning part one, chapter one.

🔊 [14:35] And it's said rather beautifully done and I think it's rather beautifully translated too.

🔊 [14:39] We'll take a look at it together.

🔊 [14:42] We'll just read the first paragraph or maybe two.

🔊 [14:4] Here I said on what look like a stone.

🔊 [14:48] Only my memory knows what it holds.

🔊 [14:50] I see it and I remember and its water flows into water so I melancholically come to myself in its image covered with dust, surrounded by grass, self-contained and condemned to memory and its variegated mirror.

🔊 [15:06] You see, it's a stone, it's also a city, it's also a town.

🔊 [15:10] Anyway, it's also a collective voice for the people in that town.

🔊 [15:15] And maybe it's Julia though as I say, I prefer to think of it as a collective voice.

🔊 [15:20] I see it, I see myself and I'm transfigured into multitude of colors and times.

🔊 [15:25] I am and I was in the colors sometimes.

🔊 [15:27] I am and I was in many eyes.

🔊 [15:30] I am only memory in the memory that one has of me.

🔊 [15:33] Okay, so the town is gone but that doesn't mean that you can't remember back and have colors and times and so forth.

🔊 [15:41] From this [? 15:41] I contemplate myself, vast, lying in a dry valley.

🔊 [15:46] I'm surrounded by a spiny mountains and yellow planes inhabited by



coyotes.

🔊 [15:52] Coyotes, I would say.

🔊 [15:55] My house, houses are squat, white-painted in their roofs appeared to be [? 16:00] for water shimmering depending on whether it is the dry or rainy season.

🔊 [16:04] There are days like today when remembering makes me sad.

🔊 [16:07] I wish I had no memory or that I could change myself into pious deaths to escape penalty of seeing myself.

🔊 [16:14] Okay, so we're not going to have to go through a lot.

🔊 [16:18] I have a long list of places where this I or we narrator, this collective voice comes into the text in ways that are really quite idiosyncratic and quite beautiful.

🔊 [16:29] Are there things you want to point out about this narrator.

🔊 [16:32] Yeah, [?16:34] would you push your little button please?

🔊 [16:35] Thank you.

🔊 [16:40] (Student) Okay, I guess I was kind of not confused, but kind of try to make something into what I want to be as I was reading this book because when I first read the book, you start at the beginning, you see the stone.

🔊 [16:52] And then you would think of it as a kind of mythic voice, but then I can't bring you get to the end and she talks about how Isabel and the stone.

🔊 [17:02] I'm thinking maybe the narrator is Isabel, but then I was thinking, okay well it can't be both, at times when she would say "I", I think Isabel.

🔊 [17:11] At times when it would say "we", I think, "Okay, Is the stone representative of everybody in the town?"

🔊 [17:16] I just didn't know.

🔊 [17:17] And so I guess it was confusing.

🔊 [17:20] I just had to put on a quiz with Isabel because I guess [? 17:24] is what may more logical sense to me, but then I guess it's magical realism thus it doesn't

have to make logical sense.

🔊 **[17:29]** (Professor) Well, there are plenty of magic here but I guess, you know, it's fine with me that you put that on the quizzes.

🔊 **[17:36]** It shows me that you've read till end of the novel which is.. quiz is for that.

🔊 **[17:39]** That's good.

🔊 **[17:40]** But it's also maybe we don't have to decide and I said I prefer one way to the other because of the "we"... which is the complicated.

🔊 **[17:48]** And this whole perspective type of play here, I think there is, and because Garro is so beautifully about the land, she's constantly giving us a sense of this kind of open, and yet, almost mountainous, and you can see there are two in different ways of this town that no longer exist.

🔊 **[18:06]** The white squat, the white-painted roofs and sun-baked water shimmering and all of that.

🔊 **[18:12]** So I think I don't think you are wrong at all and saying that it's Julia for me, it's harder to make that square with all that, that we all that, kind of mythic perspective.

🔊 **[18:25]** But either way or both ways, let's say it's both ways for now or that it somehow works.

🔊 **[18:30]** It can't be an accident that Garro ends up and makes this principle figure into a stone.

🔊 **[18:37]** And so clearly she wants that to resonate there.

🔊 **[18:40]** But one thing about magical realism that's nice as we don't always have to make a decision.

🔊 **[18:45]** We can, kind of, let it flow and sometimes it feels this and sometimes it feels that way and that's what Garro is doing, I think.

🔊 **[18:52]** She is wanting to subvert our certainty about the narrative voice.

🔊 **[18:56]** So, that strikes me that you are right to sort of toss both up and think about them and then if you come down on one side of the other, that's also okay with



me, and okay with Garro, it seems to me too.

🔊 [19:11] Other comments about the narrative structure?

🔊 [19:14] Yeah, Lisa would you comment?

🔊 [19:16] (Student) I kept kind of noting some passages that recur talking about ants.

🔊 [19:22] And I had marked here but I thought that for me and it's not fair I guess they kept bringing up because it's not part of our class.

🔊 [19:31] But the rule for novel Pedro Paramo is totally finds out the ants, bunch of souls are dead and the town is a ghost town dead and for me, this is so much the same.

🔊 [19:42] Instead of being told by sort of specifically started by the souls of the dead, it's being told by omniscient narrator of the memories of the dead.

🔊 [19:54] And it's sort of the same thing and there's a passage, I have to retrieve a marked.

🔊 [19:58] But one of my thoughts just sort of started out on..

🔊 [20:01] It's not the first one but it really goes there on 201.

🔊 [20:05] (Professor) 201, let us go there, real quick.

🔊 [20:15] (Student) It's the first complete paragraph, and starting with the second sentence.

🔊 [20:18] They're talking about Martin Moncada and they says he has entered subterranean world of the ants complicated by miniscule tunnels where there was not even room for a thought and memory was layers of earth and rotten streets, I mean he is dead.

🔊 [20:31] And there were previously [? 20:36] on 156, it's talking about the ticking on the clock represents as punctual as ants moving a piece of furniture.

🔊 [20:43] There's another one on

🔊 [20:46] (Professor) Which page was the one about you just said...?

🔊 [20:48] (Student) The ant, 156.

🔊 [20:50] (Professor). 156. Okay, I haven't noticed the ants ...

🔊 [20:53] (Student) I just thought it was interesting and then on 258, they, he calls the ants Francisco, and they said

🔊 [21:03] (Professor) Which page, sorry?

🔊 [21:04] (Student) 258.

🔊 [21:06] And he said...hold on...

🔊 [21:11] The Francisco is a thief and on that afternoon the three laughed hearing Nicholas baptize ants with the general's first name.

🔊 [21:19] And he talked about and previously I think on that same page but that's the one where it kind of got..

🔊 [21:24] Here we go, pensively, they threw little stones of the narrow combs of ants that hurried by carrying the leaves they stole [? 21:30] from the gardens.

🔊 [21:31] And it sounds like a death.

🔊 [21:33] (Professor) Right, and I had one marked now that I'm not finding where there is a discussion of the ground and being underground.

🔊 [21:41] The novel to which Lisa referred I think maybe we've referred to it earlier here is one of the most brilliant of Mexican novels then I should teach with this one.

🔊 [21:50] In the past I have taught this one because it's all as.. they suggests that it is the same kind of ,I call it, "animate earth novel."

🔊 [21:59] It's like the ground but it's got voices, and echoes and you hear the paths just kind of seeping up to the, to the surface.

🔊 [22:08] It's really a beautiful thing.

🔊 [22:10] That other novel is called pedroparamo. p a r a m o.

🔊 [22:14] It's the name of a man who's the general Rosa's figure in fact in this

little old town called Comala.

🔊 [22:24] Garro learned a great deal from that novel pedroparamo by Juan Rulfo, r u l f o.

🔊 [22:34] It's also got little scenes like this one from the revolution, the Mexican revolution.

🔊 [22:38] [? 22:38] may you with your interest in the [? 22:40] would be very interested in pedroparamo.

🔊 [22:44] So, I actually sometimes have taught in the past the third novel with this another animate earth novel which is as I lay dying oh no no no I am wrong.

🔊 [22:52] It's the <House of Breath> by William Goyen which also, it's a Texas novel.

🔊 [22:58] William Goyen actually lived in Houston, grew up in trinity Texas and he creates one of the most beautiful novels, it's one of my favorites in the world along with all of the others of course.

🔊 [23:11] It's the <House of Breath>, very pretty...

🔊 [23:13] So if you like this kind of novel, uh Amanda has left, but we need to remind her to read these when she has time because they are just [? 23:20] with nostalgia.

🔊 [23:23] Going back but you can't quite return and so forth.

🔊 [23:26] So um, thank you for those references...

🔊 [23:27] That's another animate earth issue here I think showing that all is [? 23:35]

🔊 [23:36] Now, and then, I think Sarah you had something about the uh, the narrative structure as well, could you tell us?

🔊 [23:46] (Student) Um, I was going to respond to what you said about uh, maybe Isabel.

🔊 [23:52] I was thinking it's more like she takes the place of Julia?

🔊 [23:56] Yes.



🔊 [23:57] Her positions, so I think Julie is more like um, she dictates so much with the general.

🔊 [24:03] The whole state of the town is dictated by her and [? 24:06] with her, so in [? 24:08] realism is very symbolic right?

🔊 [24:12] So, Isabel is, it's kind of a, more like a symbol.

🔊 [24:24] I want to say also, page 263 at the bottom.

🔊 [24:26] (Professor) 263 at the bottom, let us get there.

🔊 [24:29] Let's see 263, yes.

🔊 [24:32] It says "years come and years go and I [? 24:34] still wait" so it's like [? 24:35] right there.

🔊 [24:36] (Professor) Okay, thank you.

🔊 [24:38] There it's very specifically defined as the town.

🔊 [24:44] Yes, but you... let me go back to your comment about Isabel.

🔊 [24:47] We are told that early on that there are two Isabels right and she is a kind of problematic figure, we can look at that passage but um, then at the end at least when she falls in love with [? 25:00] and decides to throw caution to the wind, sacrificing her family for her love and so forth, that she's not exactly divided at all.

🔊 [25:08] She seems to be a kind of trader and so forth.

🔊 [25:13] How would you see her as symbolic and of what?

🔊 [25:17] (Student) Um...

🔊 [25:18] (Professor) Isabel.

🔊 [25:19] (Student) Well, people started to become afraid of her in the same way of they were afraid of Julia they feared her and they loved her first and they feared her when she went to be with him

🔊 [25:29] I didn't see it though that she loved him, I thought that she really had no

choice.

🔊 **[25:34]** She got pushed into it, and then she couldn't get out of it because of what you have done.

🔊 **[25:39]** And all the people hated her because she went with him while the, you know he attacked her family and was killing all her family members.

🔊 **[25:47]** And she really had nowhere to go after that.

🔊 **[25:48]** At the end **[? 25:50]** says you know you can't go to the hotel, there's no place for you.

🔊 **[25:53]** (Professor) That's right, thank you.

🔊 **[25:54]** That's a good point too.

🔊 **[25:55]** It's not that she was utterly free to make the choices that she made or the choice that she made.

🔊 **[26:02]** Um, there's one feminist critic, uh, the reason I asked you is because these two characters Julia and Isabel are kind of mirror images aren't they?

🔊 **[26:11]** You have to see it that way, both of them have a relation to Rosa and it's the opposite relation.

🔊 **[26:16]** One, Julia is the mythic beloved, who's beyond the reach of Rosa and Isabel seems to be a bit the opposite wishing that Rosa would pay attention to her or chasing after Rosa but he becomes unattainable to her.

🔊 **[26:32]** There's a woman named Jean Franco who has a book on, novels by and about women and in Mexico called plotting women. Plotting women. P l o t t i n g women.

🔊 **[26:49]** And she does this reading of Julia and Isabel as the kind of thing we've just said.

🔊 **[26:55]** The kind of mirror images of each other but what she says is that neither she critic this novel as not a feminist novel because or at least failing to represent women as selves, because both of these main characters are defined by Rosa and both are as she says outside of history.

🔊 **[27:18]** Julia is a kind of mythic person she disappears into thin air as we know,

she becomes a legend, she becomes a myth, she might as well be the version of Guadalupe.

🔊 **[27:27]** She's not a real flesh-and-blood woman who is getting her **[? 27:30]** in literature or something like that.

🔊 **[27:34]** In other words she is a kind of idea in the minds of men, and then comes Isabel who is equally an unreal according to Jean Franco this argument.

🔊 **[27:45]** In that she somehow remains outside of history too, she's petrified at the end so that we don't see any women here who are agents, who are dadada...

🔊 **[27:58]** I mean if you're interested in that kind of feminist critic, I can give you a little more information about that because Garro has been read in terms of feminist ideas but anyway both of those characters from Jean Franco's point of view are somehow subsumed by patriarchy.

🔊 **[28:19]** Let's say they are not allowed, but you can say well who isn't subsumed by patriarchy we see what general Rosa becomes a kind of drunker there doing nothing in particular.

🔊 **[28:33]** But anyway because those two women are, and because you said they are symbolic, occurred to me to go you know mention this particular reading of these characters.

🔊 **[28:45]** I mean we can say that all literary characters if it's a good work of novel are have importance beyond themselves.

🔊 **[28:51]** That we read and we say wasn't that a beautiful character or wasn't that a funny character, we get something out of it other than there's always some significance to the character depending upon the novel but there's somehow we take for example, take any of our... take the **[? 29:09]** figure in the novel we've just finished.

🔊 **[29:11]** What is the represent.

🔊 **[29:13]** Well they represent some particular attitude toward indigenous cultures.

🔊 **[29:17]** And we talked about him in those terms beyond being a particular self so I guess when you think about characters and novels you might want to think about how they operate on a scale beyond just their singular selves.

🔊 **[29:35]** Um, other comments about the narrative technique.

🔊 [29:39] Why do you think she does this.

🔊 [29:40] I am going to ask this same question I asked about the frame narration in the story teller.

🔊 [29:46] Why?

🔊 [29:47] What is the effect on the reader that couldn't have been gotten if you've just narrated this without that 'I' narrator.

🔊 [29:54] She could easily have told I mean Garro could have decided that this was a [? 29:58] retrospective narrative telling about the town and what happened and so forth.

🔊 [30:05] Yes, Jenny

🔊 [30:06] (Student) Well I think that when you have an "I" narrator there comes with that a certain judgment and a certain perspective that only that "I" narrator has and so you don't necessarily get the full picture or um, a non-bias kind of an outlook about, of events.

🔊 [30:28] So I think that when you use omniscient narrator like she does whether it'd be the town or the stone or whatever it gives... you get the full effect and you don't get judgment with the story, I don't think and I think it's told the way it was without...

🔊 [30:52] (Professor) What you are pointing out is quite true that this is someplace in between a first-person narrator and an omniscient narrator because we have the general perspective.

🔊 [31:01] It's not like because usually an "I" narrator is one of the character in the novel.

🔊 [31:05] [? 31:05] what happened to be yesterday and I walked out of my front door and so forth.

🔊 [31:09] And so you get the perspective of that single character and lots of times first-person narrator in fact we say always are partial and often unreliable because you can't tell if a first-person narrator is telling you the truth.

🔊 [31:22] He's telling you or she's telling you within the novel what he or she knows.

🔊 **[31:26]** (Student) And I think you also like in this novel there's a lot that if it was an "I" narrator and if it was a character in the novel you couldn't get.

🔊 **[31:34]** (Professor) No you couldn't. Yes.

🔊 **[31:35]** (Student) You couldn't, I mean this person, there are things that are happening everywhere in one time and there's no way that you could get the full fact of the story.

🔊 **[31:44]** (Professor) Yes, because a first-person narrative, if the character exists in the novel can only know what a character in that room, sitting in an ...given room that is happening at that point.

🔊 **[31:55]** Yes, **[? 31:55]** were you going to say something...?

🔊 **[31:59]** (Student) Uh, yes. Again, this is what I **[? 32:00]** between who I thought was the narrator, it actually kind of irritated me after a while because I didn't figure it out.

🔊 **[32:08]** But I think that when I listed up my chart who I thought would be the narrator one of my thought were the stone and land being the narrator was because uh, if you want to, if she wanted to represent as a, I guess a kind of collective memory because when you say "I" it's not a collective memory it's just what that one calls.

🔊 **[32:26]** So, I thought in order for her to make the effect she wanted to tell us that ok this is what happened to this town, this is not what happened to this person or this family, this is what happened to this town, so I think that's why she was trying well I'm not going to say try, I think that's why she did make a narrator the land so it could be kind of collective memory so like she said if all these things are going on at one time Isabel can possibly be in all these places at one time and she possibly couldn't have known.

🔊 **[32:55]** (Professor) Yes, I think collective voice thing is really important.

🔊 **[32:59]** Remember I pointed out when we were reading Garcia Marquez's both novels that every once a while you will have a "we" and you will have a "here" instead of "there", it's "here" and you'll remind that this is something like the same kind of thing.

🔊 **[33:12]** Of course "here" it's so like every page and Garcia Marquez every once in a while slips in but if you don't learn anything else from an English class that I know many of you are taking this for history credit but um this is both I hope but in an English class you will always pay attention to narrative technique because if you

don't do that then you might as well say well reading a novel is as same as reading a newspaper.

🔊 [33:37] Everything written has a point of view.

🔊 [33:38] In the newspaper we take it as a kind of general voice reporting what happened yesterday in Pakistan and we read The New York Times and we read the chronicle we have a certain expectation of objectivity even though we know that that's just an expectation at times.

🔊 [33:56] But in a novel this is all constructed very carefully as a work of art so we have to think about its effect.

🔊 [34:03] Other comments about this retrospective filtering of memory, yes Lisa?

🔊 [34:08] (Student) I like the earlier comment here with Julia kind of combining Julia and Isabel, what I think the narrator is both the stone and the town and it's Isabel but I think in the beginning when it's more the stone they make some references on addict uh, I can't pull them out that quick but the town is recalling and saying very directly that Julia is the center of the town, Julia is the center of our attention and so I think that narrative technique kind of brings full circle because Julia is the center of the town, Isabel replaces Julia, so Isabel becomes the center of the town and it's sort of and then Isabel becomes the narrator so it's sort of gives us a time lesson as in a cycle that does something about that recollection.

🔊 [34:54] (Professor) Yes, thank you that's interesting.

🔊 [34:55] Did you have a comment also back there?

🔊 [35:01] (Student) It's basically what [? 35:01] said but yes um, if the narrator was completely omniscient then we would have gotten the close view from all the characters that we did get.

🔊 [35:11] Yes, thank you.

🔊 [35:14] The only thing that did bother me is that if the town was really the narrator then it wouldn't have called itself [? 35:22] but it did.

🔊 [35:24] You know what I mean?

🔊 [35:25] If the town, if the narrator was the town itself then it would have never mentioned what it's name was unless that I [35:31].

🔊 [35:32] (Professor) Well it could be but actually that only I think that is only the



one place as I recall were actually caused itself by it's name but it's the town that it's also that rock, it's that land, it's somehow, we have to think about what myth, mythic narrative might be.

🔊 **[32:51]** Yes, **[35:52]**?

🔊 **[35:52]** (Student) One thing that's bothering me right now is um, if it is the rock and the rock is Isabel how do we get an unbiased account of what happened?

🔊 **[36:01]** (Professor) Well, maybe you are willing to disagree with Jenny and say that it's not unbiased.

🔊 **[36:07]** (Student) I do agree on...

🔊 **[36:09]** (Professor) You think it's unbiased.

🔊 **[36:09]** (Student) Yeah, but it's just kind of weird how people said of.

🔊 **[36:13]** (Professor) Yes, I totally agree with you it's weird.

🔊 **[36:15]** It's really one of the only novels I can think of where it is a first-person whether plural or singular I or we it's a first-person narrative that also attempts to be omniscient and does gives us this stuff that I couldn't know.

🔊 **[36:33]** So that's kind of why I begin our discussion with that, it seems to me a contradiction in terms.

🔊 **[36:41]** I don't think this is an unbiased novel actually but Jenny you go ahead and say what you are going to say.

🔊 **[36:45]** (Student) Well I was going to say that as the narrator is one narrator is also like a collection of things that make it one.

🔊 **[36:58]** (Professor) Yes, sure so it's the parts that make the whole if you want.

🔊 **[37:01]** Yes, um, I wouldn't say I don't think it's politically the novel isn't unbiased in the sense that general Rosa sees his portrait is a horrible guy.

🔊 **[37:11]** I mean in part this is a dictator novel.

🔊 **[37:15]** We see another dictator novel or sort of one which is the general and labyrinth that's not quite a dictator novel but you know that subgenre in American fiction.

🔊 [37:24] Many writers have written dictator novels including Garcia Marquez not just the labyrinth, the general of labyrinth but also one called autumn of the patriarch which is his dictator novel and Garcia Marquez um, sorry Vargas Liosa has his about [? 37:42] and the Dominican republic came out about four years ago called the fiesta of the goat, fiesta [? 37:50] about the [? 37:52] who was horrible.

🔊 [37:55] I got tired of reading that novel because I got tired of rapes and humiliations and all sorts of other gross [? 38:00] but he does a very good job of doing a dictator novel.

🔊 [38:07] You know in an way this is a dictator novel too.

🔊 [38:08] Clearly the narrator and the author have a position to take on the politics of them, that are the, uh, described here.

🔊 [38:16] Yes, Ryan?

🔊 [38:19] (Student) Could it be perhaps a Gar was just trying to emphasize the tragedy of the story, not just this town but of all the Mexico at this time and perhaps maybe if she narrated in another way she couldn't have accomplished it? I don't know.

🔊 [38:32] (Professor) Yes, I think this is a very as Amanda said earlier it doesn't end well, this is very bitter sweet.

🔊 [38:42] It's bittersweet because it's so beautifully done but oh yeah this is a very tragic tale and you know whether this kind of collective "I" narrator, collective "I" that makes no sense, but there it is, that's what it is a collective first-person narrator allows to do that better probably so because there's this...I won't say wining because it's not wining but there's all this lament that's the word lament for what's happened.

🔊 [39:09] We used to be you know brightly colored houses, now there's dust all...so dust to dust...

🔊 [39:17] I think you're right, I think that in personalizing the narrative voice does make the nostalgia more palpable.

🔊 [39:25] The nostalgia for, how things didn't work out.

🔊 [39:29] And how they should have and how there are bullies and how there are mistakes and so forth so and what I would say to you about narrative technique too, this is a generalization and I think it's a correct one, is whenever you have a personified narrator in a piece of fiction is calling attention to the problem of telling

the story.

🔊 **[39:48]** In other an Omniscient narrator as once upon a time there were three wise men or once upon a time there were two, there were three little bears and goldilocks and so forth.

🔊 **[39:57]** You just get right into the story there then you think about the three little bears or whatever, that's a terrible example um,

🔊 **[40:05]** Whereas when you have someone saying let me tell you how my mother told me that story about the three little bears then you are problematizing the nature of narrative itself.

🔊 **[40:17]** How do you tell the story?

🔊 **[40:18]** Who's version?

🔊 **[40:19]** Well mine but it was my mother's before and so forth.

🔊 **[40:23]** So this kind of filtering, I like to call it filtering of memory through the narrative voice I think effects this novel tremendously.

🔊 **[40:33]** I think it would be less effective otherwise there are flashes forward to the end, there are lots of flashes backwards.

🔊 **[40:43]** We see the town contemplating itself and so forth.

🔊 **[40:48]** I am going to leave that to you.

🔊 **[40:49]** Other comments about the narrative technique?

🔊 **[40:52]** I think it's incredibly successful.

🔊 **[40:54]** I don't like the ending particularly personally it just seems like oops too quick, but um, I think from the point of view of the verbal surface as I like to say, that the language and the structuring of the narrative is a great success because it's unique in my experience and um, well the other would be Pedro Paramo and the third would be the House of Breath by William Goyen the ones I have mentioned before but it's not very often that you will have a disappeared town that narrates it's own story.

🔊 **[41:30]** The House of Breath, it's a more of a singular narrator.

🔊[41:33] A young boy who goes back to find this town, that's now a ghost town.

🔊[41:37] A very beautiful too.

🔊[41:41] Okay, other comments about the narrative technique, I mean we can get further into it if we want but I think maybe that's enough for that.

🔊[41:50] What I'd like to do is look at a few other things.

🔊[41:52] Um, I'm going to leave it to you the notice the descriptions of the land starting with the rock upon which the narrator sits or is it the rock is the narrator blah blah so we are going to do that.

🔊[42:06] I want to look at the dictator aspect of this and I said of this next time I am going to show you some pictures of the mess all Americans [? 42:14] those painted the book look at the time and timelessness of shifting time,

🔊[42:21] But there is one place, to fifty five for I'd like to go now with a dictator novel that Rosa's figure which is really you know that terribleness of this novel and terribleness of history Latin America in lots of parts the strong a person who then begins to torture the weak people and indeed that little engraving at the top of page two fifty four in the beginning of the chapter eleven second part is apropos.

🔊[42:55] Here, I am going to read about two or three paragraphs because we will see the dictator and we also see this business of theme of time.

🔊[43:04] And how time and space are unified and it is very hard for us to think of that cause of westerners, we have calendars and we have maps.

🔊[43:12] We have time and we have spaces.

🔊[43:15] but the indigenous mass of American way was not that it was too integrate time and space to think of kind of living medium.

🔊[43:23] I will talk to you more about it.

🔊[43:25] It is harder to think about because we don't think about time and space in those ways.

🔊[43:32] But look at this [? 43:35] couple of three paragraphs here two fifty five I will just go ahead and read them and comment on them as we go.



🔊[43:43] Where do dates come from and where did they go?

🔊[43:46] They travelled for a whole year and with the precision of aero [? 43:50] appointed dates to show us a pass now present in space [? 43:55] and burn out.

🔊[43:56] Okay, what [? 43: 56] and burns out? , a comet. What is this aero?

🔊[44:02] And aero moves through space.

🔊[44:04] But she is talking about dates and she is talking about time.

🔊[44:09] She is working as hard as she can and I think successfully overcome in this one sentence we will see more of it the separation of time and space.

🔊[44:15] She is specializing those dates.

🔊[44:18] She is making the dates into things that exist in space.

🔊[44:22] And aero something moving through space like an aero something goes through space like comets.

🔊[44:29] The dates emerge punctually from invisible time and it didn't instantly recover the fragment of gestures.

🔊[44:38] The tower of forgotten city, the words of heroes by dissected in books with the astonishment the morning of our baptism when they gave us a name, which would be a date or birthday.

🔊[44:50] To enter the nearby space we were forgot we merely have to order the magic of number and what number she order a date?

🔊[44:59] So you see how she is really trying and when you read it appreciate thing and Oh my goodness, this is kind of overwrought, heavy breathing as I sometimes say about too poetic the pros which she is trying to accomplish you, which she is trying to accomplish is to break done [? 45:14], so we have done it in the first paragraph now and she is kind of come out of the other way she says all you have to do if you want to enter space is other an number and then she utters the number of her birthday.

🔊[45:25] In my, oh no I am sorry. The number of our, the number of date which is October first will be forever the day when the trial of the death debt, guests begin.

🔊[45:35] When I say it and I am no longer sitting on this apparent stone.

🔊[45:39] I also love that apparent stone which not a real stone I guess. It just looks like stone. What is this? Anyway.

🔊[45:45] When I say that I am no longer sitting on this apparent stone I am below slowly entering the plaza following my people who begins gathering there very early to learn the fate of the accused.

🔊[45:56] You see how brilliantly as we get the narrative discussion of time and space we are looking at that invisible narrator or is it the stone or is it Isabel and then within about half a sentence or moving into the retrospective narrative.

🔊[46:11] She is great at transitions and will be contemplating dates, aero and comets and then suddenly we are looking at the plaza and those people and next sentence takes us down to the story, the realistic story that we are following the retrospective narrative of these events.

🔊[46:30] The sentence took place inside the military command and we follow step by step the words and gestures that took place behind closed doors.

🔊[46:39] The general passed us now, she is one of the towns people there this narrator who are looking at the tree tops.

🔊[46:47] At this moment I can't smell the freshness of this colon and see his empty glance at leaves and branches.

🔊[46:53] We have just skipped in that sense from the past to the general past us looking at us and I can smell.

🔊[46:59] She didn't say I could smell, she is like can smell.

🔊[47:02] and I will refer to her, she, sorry I just like do that.

🔊[47:07] Smell is fresh. The freshness is colon, so we are back and forth what is

going on a couple of three paragraphs has kind of impressive.

🔊[47:16] We will remain under his motionless shadow which motionlessness and timelessness are very frequent here.

🔊[47:24] We remain under his motionlessness shadow which repeated the same crime over and over again with the same with painstaking precision of a maniac.

🔊[47:34] In his immovable time the trees did not change their leaves.

🔊[47:39] the stars were fixed, [? 47:40] come and go with the same.

🔊[47:42] In the immobile time like time stops, right? To come in to go with the same. Francisco Rosa stopped the amorous current that makes, an makes, words and deeds and kept this in his circular hell.

🔊[47:58] The moon palace had wanted to run away to find the coming and going of the stars and ties luminance time that spins around the sun.

🔊[48:05] The space for distances are within the reach one hand and they wanted to escape from single bloody day of [? 48:10].

🔊[48:12] The Rosa's abolish the door that leads us to the memory of space, how she is mixing stuff around here abolishes the door that leads to the memory of space [? 48:24] he blame them in the motionless shadow heaped upon us.

🔊[48:29] Well, you start together. This is really piling a lot of stuff on here.

🔊[48:33] Let's just finish the paragraph.

🔊[48:35] The general only knew of the existence of a few streets and [? 48:38] believing in them. They became unreal to him.

🔊[48:44] Wait a minute. What is that? [? 48:44] by believing them and they became unreal to him and the only touch them when he pursued the shadows. He found on her corners we paid him for his fixed world with crimes.

🔊[48:57] Okay, so then we get more into the story. It is very typical that these chapters will start with a kind of meditation this metaphysical if you want kind of discussion of time and space or the narrative perspective being here and there but

right after this we get back into the action of the narrative.

🔊**[49:19]** but you see what I'm talking about with this attempt to specialized time to make time material to make it object you could look at, that you could feel and that you can measure literally.

🔊**[49:35]** So, anyway, that is going to be our topic for next time and will see more about that.

🔊**[49:40]** But I want to read that passage because when you are looking at this between now and Thursday please do keep in mind this space-time, timelessness, spacelessness under current let's say that I think it is really the cause for the magical realism of this novel.

🔊**[50:00]** It's less Julia disappears in a puff of smoke.

🔊**[50:04]** It's more that we can't quite get our feet on the ground because first of all it just, let's say dead town being **[? 50:15]** by this breath of narration and that is what the house of breath is about.

🔊**[50:22]** You tell the story in it we **[? 50:23]** the dead town.

🔊**[50:29]** But here also the timelessness and time-space aspect that also unsettling let's say.

🔊**[50:37]** Okay, let me just a couple more things and then I am going to let you go.

🔊**[50:42]** I have said that this is kind of dictator novel which is a Latin American subgenre.

🔊**[50:48]** It is also revolutionary novel that is a novel about the Mexican revolution and it is **[? 50:54]**.

🔊**[50:55]** That is another subgenre in Mexico. The Mexican revolution has generated lots of the novels about the Mexican revolution.

🔊**[51:04]** It is kind of they are famous writers of the revolution Martin Louis **[? 51:08]** and others.

🔊**[51:11]** And then I would also say that it is satiric novel about the revolution



shows how stupid the revolution is. How the people are corrupt, how they are silly.

🔊[51:20] There is a lot of kink of comic stuff going on here too with the president with the prostitute and so forth, so there is something satiric.

🔊[51:28] This is one we read in Mexico I think Lisa [? 51:33], the lightning in August if you want to hilarious and send-up of the mass of the Mexican revolution was and how people were running around the not knowing what they are doing and how you know generals became generals just by accident read lightening in august by Ho say, no, [? 51:54] is his last name good bass [? 51:59] name IBEN what? "IBEARGUENGOITA"

🔊[52:13] I should write down that but I won't.

🔊[52:15] And then I also think it is magical realist novel as I have been saying, so there is plenty going on here in terms of what type of novel this would be.

🔊[52:24] The ones we have had so far you can, I can anyway think up so many categories is that the storyteller is a novel with it seems to me a realistic novel with the interspersed chapters which are also representative as realistic from a different cultural point of view on the same with the general in his lab you can really say as magical realism dictators etc.

🔊[52:47] So this one I think it is kind of defined a lot of categories or fitting kind of into a lot.

🔊[52:53] But [? 52:54] and let you go and if you English major would stick around for just a minute I would appreciate that is those of you taking the course for English credit.

🔊[53:02] I will give you evaluations.

🔊[53:05] Thank you very much and see you next time.